arXiv:1303.2249v2 [math.NT] 14 Mar 2013

Numbers with three close factorizations

Tsz Ho Chan

Abstract

In this paper, we study numbers n that can be factored in three different ways as $n = A_1 B_1 = A_2 B_2 = A_3 B_3$ where A_1, A_2, A_3 are close to each other and B_1, B_2, B_3 are close to each other.

1 Introduction and main results

Suppose a positive integer n can be factored as $n = AB$. Is it possible to have another factorization $n = (A + a)(B - b)$ with small positive integers a and b? The answer is yes. For this to hold, we require $AB = (A + a)(B - b)$ or $ab = aB - bA$. Let $d = (a, b)$ and $a = da'$, $b = db'$. Then $da'b' = a'B - b'A$. This implies that $a'|A$ and $b'|B$ since a' and b' are relatively prime. Let $A = a'A'$ and $B = b'B'$. Then $d = B' - A'$. Therefore any such number would have the form $n = (a'A')(b'(A' + d)) = (a'(A' + d))(b'A')$ where a', b', d are small and A' can be arbitrarily large. What if we ask for two such extra factorizations, i.e. $n = AB = (A+a_1)(B-b_1) = (A+a_2)(B-b_2)$? It turns out that A and B cannot be arbitrarily large. We have

Theorem 1 *Given $C \geq 2$. If $n = AB = (A + a_1)(B - b_1) = (A + a_2)(B - b_2)$ with $1 \leq a_1 < a_2 \leq C$ and $1 \leq b_1 < b_2 \leq C$, then $A, B < C^3$.*

One can ask if the upper bound C^3 is sharp and we have the following.

Theorem 2 *Given $C \geq 10$. If $n = AB = (A + a_1)(B - b_1) = (A + a_2)(B - b_2)$ with $1 \leq a_1 < a_2 \leq C$ and $1 \leq b_1 < b_2 \leq C$, then $A, B \leq \frac{1}{4}C^3 - \frac{1}{2}C^2 + \frac{1}{4}C$.*

Here the upper bound is best possible. For example, based on the proof of Theorem 2 (with $a_1 = N$, $a_2 = 2N + 1$, $b_1 = N + 1$, $b_2 = 2N + 3$), consider

$$n = N(N + 1)^2(N + 2)(2N + 1)(2N + 3). \tag{1}$$

Firstly,

$$n = [(2N + 1)N(N + 2)] \cdot [(2N + 3)(N + 1)^2] =: A \cdot B.$$

Secondly,

$$n = [(2N+3)(N+1)N]\cdot[(2N+1)(N+1)(N+2)] = [(2N+1)N(N+2)+N]\cdot[(2N+3)(N+1)^2-(N+1)].$$

Thirdly,

$$n = [(2N+1)(N+1)^2]\cdot[(2N+3)N(N+2)] = [(2N+1)N(N+2)+(2N+1)]\cdot[(2N+3)(N+1)^2-(2N+3)].$$

With $C = 2N+3$, this shows that there are infinitely many integers n satisfying the hypothesis in Theorem 1 or 2 with $\max(A, B) \geq \frac{1}{4}C^3 - \frac{1}{2}C^2 + \frac{1}{4}C$.

In a different perspective, we can think of finding three close factorizations of n as finding three close lattice points on the hyperbola $xy = n$. Granville and Jiménez-Urroz [1] gave a lower bound for an arc of the hyperbola containing k integer lattice points. Suppose (x_1, y_1), (x_2, y_2) and (x_3, y_3) are three integer lattice points on $xy = n$ with $x_1 < x_2 < x_3$. They showed that $x_3 - x_1 \geq 2^{2/3} x_1 / n^{1/3}$. From Theorem 2, we have

Corollary 1 *Suppose* (x_1, y_1), (x_2, y_2) *and* (x_3, y_3) *are three integer lattice points on* $xy = n$ *with* $x_1 < x_2 < x_3$. *Then* $\max(x_3 - x_1, y_1 - y_3) > 2^{2/3} n^{1/6} + 0.5$.

Moreover there exist infinitely many integer n *such that the hyperbola* $xy = n$ *contains three integer lattice points* (x_1, y_1), (x_2, y_2) *and* (x_3, y_3) *with* $x_1 < x_2 < x_3$ *satisfying* $\max(x_3 - x_1, y_1 - y_3) < 2^{2/3} n^{1/6} + 1.2$.

This shows that the constant $2^{2/3}$ in all of the above is sharp. It also shows that the lower bound in the first half of Corollary 1 is best possible (apart from a constant) which vanquishes any hope to improve the lower bound to $\gg n^{1/4}$ as claimed in [1].

2 Proof of Theorem 1

Suppose $AB = (A + a_1)(B - b_1) = (A + a_2)(B - b_2)$ with $1 \leq a_1 < a_2 \leq C$ and $1 \leq b_1 < b_2 \leq C$. Then $a_1 B - b_1 A = a_1 b_1$. Dividing by $b_1 B$, we have $\frac{a_1}{b_1} - \frac{A}{B} = \frac{a_1}{B}$. Similarly $\frac{a_2}{b_2} - \frac{A}{B} = \frac{a_2}{B}$. Subtracting the two equations, we have $\frac{a_2}{b_2} - \frac{a_1}{b_1} = \frac{a_2 - a_1}{B} > 0$. Hence $\frac{1}{C^2} \leq \frac{1}{b_1 b_2} \leq \frac{a_2 b_1 - a_1 b_2}{b_1 b_2} = \frac{a_2 - a_1}{B} < \frac{C}{B}$. This gives $B < C^3$. Similarly, one also has $A < C^3$.

3 Proof of Theorem 2

Without loss of generality, we can assume that A, $A + a_1$, $A + a_2$ are three consecutive divisors of n. From the proof of Theorem 1, we have $\frac{a_2 b_1 - b_2 a_1}{b_1 b_2} = \frac{a_2 - a_1}{B}$. Let $d = (a_2 - a_1) b_1 - (b_2 - b_1) a_1 \geq 1$. Then $B = \frac{b_2 b_1 (a_2 - a_1)}{d} = \frac{b_2 (a_1 (b_2 - b_1) + d)}{d} = \frac{1}{d} a_1 b_2 (b_2 - b_1) + b_2$. Suppose $a_2 - a_1 = \phi a_1$ and $b_2 - b_1 = \theta b_1$. Since $(a_2 - a_1) b_1 - (b_2 - b_1) a_1 > 0$, we have $\phi > \theta$.

Case 1: $a_2 = b_2$. Then from $AB = (A + a_2)(B - b_2)$, we have $a_2 = B - A > 0$. Now $A < A + a_1 < A + a_2 = B$ and $A + a_2 = B > B - b_1 > B - b_2 = A$. Since we assume that A, $A + a_1$, $A + a_2$ are three consecutive divisors of n, we must have $A + a_1 = B - b_1 =: M$ say. So $n = M^2 = (M + (a_2 - a_1))(M - (b_2 - b_1))$. This implies $(a_2 - a_1)(b_2 - b_1) = ((a_2 - a_1) - (b_2 - b_1))M$. As the left hand side is positive, the right hand side must be at least M. Therefore $C^2 > (a_2 - a_1)(b_2 - b_1) = ((a_2 - a_1) - (b_2 - b_1))M \geq M$ which implies $A, B < C^2 + C \leq \frac{1}{4} C^3 - \frac{1}{2} C^2 + \frac{1}{4} C$ when $C \geq 7$.

Case 2: $|a_2 - b_2| = 1$. We will treat the case where $a_2 = b_2 + 1$. The other case $a_2 + 1 = b_2$ is similar. We have

$$n = AB = (A + a_2)(B - (a_2 - 1)) \tag{2}$$

which implies $a_2(B - A) + A = a_2(a_2 - 1)$. So $a_2 | A$ and we write $A = a_2 A'$. Substituting this into (2), we have $A'B = (A' + 1)(B - (a_2 - 1))$ which implies $B - (a_2 - 1)A' = (a_2 - 1)$. So $a_2 - 1 | B$ and we write $B = (a_2 - 1)B'$. Substituting these new expressions for A and B into (2), we obtain $A'B' = (A' + 1)(B' - 1)$ which implies $B' = A' + 1$. Therefore

$$A = a_2 A' \text{ and } B = (a_2 - 1)(A' + 1)$$

and the three factorizations are

$$n = [a_2 A'][(a_2 - 1)(A' + 1)] = [a_2 A' + h][(a_2 - 1)A' + k] = [a_2 A' + a_2][(a_2 - 1)A']$$

for some $0 < h < a_2$ and $0 < k < a_2 - 1$. Focusing on the last equality, we have, after some algebra,

$$(a_2 - h)(a_2 - 1 - k)A' = hk(A' + 1). \tag{3}$$

Since A' and $A' + 1$ are relatively prime, we must have $A'|hk$ and $A' + 1|(a_2 - h)(a_2 - 1 - k)$.

Subcase 1: $hk = lA'$ and $(a_2 - h)(a_2 - 1 - k) = l(A' + 1)$ for some integer $l \geq 2$. Then $l^2A'(A' + 1) = h(a_2 - h)k(a_2 - 1 - k) \leq (\frac{a_2}{2})^2(\frac{a_2-1}{2})^2$. This implies $A' \leq \frac{a_2(a_2-1)}{4l^2} \leq \frac{a_2^2-a_2}{16}$. So $A = a_2A' \leq \frac{a_2^3-a_2^2}{16} \leq \frac{1}{4}C^3 - \frac{1}{2}C^2 + \frac{1}{4}C$ for $C \geq 3$. Similarly one can show that $B \leq \frac{1}{4}C^3 - \frac{1}{2}C^2 + \frac{1}{4}C$.

Subcase 2: $hk = A'$ and $(a_2 - h)(a_2 - 1 - k) = A' + 1$. Subtracting them, we have $a_2(a_2-1)-h(a_2-1)-ka_2 = 1$ which implies $a_2(a_2-1)-a_2h-a_2k = 1-h$. So $a_2|h-1$ which forces $h = 1$ as $0 < h < a_2$. This implies $A' = k < a_2 - 1$ and hence $A \leq a_2(a_2 - 1) \leq \frac{1}{4}C^3 - \frac{1}{2}C^2 + \frac{1}{4}C$ for $C \geq 6$. Similarly $B \leq \frac{1}{4}C^3 - \frac{1}{2}C^2 + \frac{1}{4}C$.

Case 3: $a_2 - b_2 = 2$. Then

$$n = AB = (A + a_2)(B - (a_2 - 2)) \tag{4}$$

which implies $a_2(B - A) - 2A = a_2(a_2 - 2)$. So $a_2|2A$ and write $2A = a_2A'$. Multiplying (4) by two and substituting $2A = a_2A'$, we have $A'B = (A' + 2)(B - (a_2 - 2))$ which implies $2B - (a_2 - 2)A' = 2(a_2 - 2)$. We have $a_2 - 2|2B$ and write $2B = (a_2 - 2)B'$. Substituting these new expressions for A and B into (4), we have $A'B' = (A' + 2)(B' - 2)$ which implies $B' = A' + 2$. Therefore

$$A = \frac{a_2A'}{2} \text{ and } B = \frac{(a_2 - 2)(A' + 2)}{2}$$

and the three factorizations are

$$n = \Big[\frac{a_2A'}{2}\Big]\Big[\frac{(a_2 - 2)(A' + 2)}{2}\Big] = \Big[\frac{a_2A'}{2} + h\Big]\Big[\frac{(a_2 - 2)A'}{2} + k\Big] = \Big[\frac{a_2(A' + 2)}{2}\Big]\Big[\frac{(a_2 - 2)A'}{2}\Big]$$

for some $0 < h < a_2$ and $0 < k < a_2 - 2$. Focusing on the last equality, we have, after some algebra,

$$(a_2 - h)(a_2 - 2 - k)A' = hk(A' + 2). \tag{5}$$

Subcase 1: If A' is odd, then A' and $A' + 2$ are relatively prime. Then we must have $A'|hk$ and $A' + 2|(a_2 - h)(a_2 - 2 - k)$. Say $hk = lA'$ and $(a_2 - h)(a_2 - 2 - k) = l(A' + 2)$. So $l^2A'(A' + 2) = h(a_2 - h)k(a_2 - 2 - k) \leq (\frac{a_2}{2})^2(\frac{a_2-2}{2})^2$ which implies $A' \leq \frac{a_2(a_2-2)}{4}$. Therefore $A = \frac{a_2A'}{2} \leq \frac{a_2^3-2a_2^2}{8} \leq \frac{1}{4}C^3 - \frac{1}{2}C^2 + \frac{1}{4}C$ for $C \geq 2$. Similarly one also has $B \leq \frac{1}{4}C^3 - \frac{1}{2}C^2 + \frac{1}{4}C$.

Subcase 2: If A' is even, say $A' = 2A''$. Then (5) becomes

$$(a_2 - h)(a_2 - 2 - k)A'' = hk(A'' + 1).$$

Since A'' and $A'' + 1$ are relatively prime, we must have $A''|hk$ and $A'' + 2|(a_2 - h)(a_2 - 2 - k)$. Say $hk = lA''$ and $(a_2 - h)(a_2 - 2 - k) = l(A'' + 1)$.

Subsubcase 1: If $l \geq 2$, then $l^2A''(A'' + 1) = h(a_2 - h)k(a_2 - 2 - k) \leq (\frac{a_2}{2})^2(\frac{a_2-2}{2})^2$ which implies $A'' \leq \frac{a_2(a_2-2)}{8}$. Hence $A' = 2A'' \leq \frac{a_2(a_2-2)}{4}$ and $A = \frac{a_2A}{2} \leq \frac{a_2^3-2a_2^2}{8} \leq \frac{1}{4}C^3 - \frac{1}{2}C^2 + \frac{1}{4}C$ for $C \geq 2$. Similarly $B \leq \frac{1}{4}C^3 - \frac{1}{2}C^2 + \frac{1}{4}C$.

Subsubcase 2: If $l = 1$, then $hk = A''$ and $(a_2 - h)(a_2 - 2 - k) = A'' + 1$. Subtracting, we have $a_2(a_2 - 2) - (a_2 - 2)h - a_2k = 1$. On one hand $a_2(a_2 - 2) - a_2h - a_2k = 1 - 2h$

which implies $a_2|2h-1$. Since $0 < h < a_2$, we must have $a_2 = 2h-1$ which implies $h = \frac{a_2+1}{2}$. Substituting this into $a_2(a_2-2) - a_2h - a_2k = 1-2h$, we obtain $k = \frac{a_2-3}{2}$. Therefore $A'' = (\frac{a_2+1}{2})(\frac{a_2-3}{2})$ and $A' = 2A'' = \frac{(a_2+1)(a_2-3)}{2}$. So $A = \frac{a_2A'}{2} = \frac{a_2^3-2a_2^2-3a_2}{4} \leq \frac{1}{4}C^3 - \frac{1}{2}C^2 + \frac{1}{4}C$ and $B = \frac{(a_2-2)(A'+2)}{2} = \frac{(a_2-2)(a_2-1)^2}{4} = \frac{a_2^3-4a_2^2+5a_2-2}{4} \leq \frac{1}{4}C^3 - \frac{1}{2}C^2 + \frac{1}{4}C$ for $C \geq 10$.

Case 4: $b_2 - a_2 = 2$. Then

$$n = AB = (A + (a_2-2))(B - a_2) \tag{6}$$

which implies $(a_2-2)B - a_2A = a_2(a_2-2)$. So $a_2|2B$ and write $2B = a_2B'$. Multiplying (6) by two and substituting $2B = a_2B'$, we have $AB' = (A + (a_2-2))(B'-2)$ which implies $(a_2-2)B' - 2A = 2(a_2-2)$. We have $a_2 - 2|2A$ and write $2A = (a_2-2)A'$. Substituting these new expressions for A and B into (6), we have $A'B' = (A'+2)(B'-2)$ which implies $B' = A' + 2$. Therefore

$$A = \frac{(a_2-2)A'}{2} \text{ and } B = \frac{a_2(A'+2)}{2}$$

and the three factorizations are

$$n = \Big[\frac{(a_2-2)A'}{2}\Big]\Big[\frac{a_2(A'+2)}{2}\Big] = \Big[\frac{(a_2-2)A'}{2} + h\Big]\Big[\frac{a_2A'}{2} + k\Big] = \Big[\frac{(a_2-2)(A'+2)}{2}\Big]\Big[\frac{a_2A'}{2}\Big]$$

for some $0 < h < a_2 - 2$ and $0 < k < a_2$. Focusing on the last equality, we have, after some algebra,

$$(a_2-2-h)(a_2-k)A' = hk(A'+2). \tag{7}$$

Subcase 1: If A' is odd, then A' and $A'+2$ are relatively prime. Then we must have $A'|hk$ and $A'+2|(a_2-2-h)(a_2-k)$. Say $hk = lA'$ and $(a_2-2-h)(a_2-k) = l(A'+2)$. So $l^2A'(A'+2) = h(a_2-2-h)k(a_2-k) \leq (\frac{a_2}{2})^2(\frac{a_2-2}{2})^2$ which implies $A' \leq \frac{a_2(a_2-2)}{4}$. Therefore $A = \frac{(a_2-2)A'}{2} \leq \frac{a_2^3-4a_2^2+4a_2}{8} \leq \frac{1}{4}C^3 - \frac{1}{2}C^2 + \frac{1}{4}C$. Similarly one also has $B \leq \frac{1}{4}C^3 - \frac{1}{2}C^2 + \frac{1}{4}C$ for $C \geq 4$.

Subcase 2: If A' is even, say $A' = 2A''$. Then (7) becomes

$$(a_2-2-h)(a_2-k)A'' = hk(A''+1).$$

Since A'' and $A''+1$ are relatively prime, we must have $A''|hk$ and $A''+2|(a_2-2-h)(a_2-k)$. Say $hk = lA''$ and $(a_2-2-h)(a_2-k) = l(A''+1)$.

Subsubcase 1: If $l \geq 2$, then $l^2A''(A''+1) = h(a_2-2-h)k(a_2-k) \leq (\frac{a_2}{2})^2(\frac{a_2-2}{2})^2$ which implies $A'' \leq \frac{a_2(a_2-2)}{8}$. Hence $A' = 2A'' \leq \frac{a_2(a_2-2)}{4}$ and $A = \frac{(a_2-2)A}{2} \leq \frac{a_2^3-4a_2^2+4a_2}{8} \leq \frac{1}{4}C^3 - \frac{1}{2}C^2 + \frac{1}{4}C$. Similarly $B \leq \frac{1}{4}C^3 - \frac{1}{2}C^2 + \frac{1}{4}C$ for $C \geq 4$.

Subsubcase 2: If $l = 1$, then $hk = A''$ and $(a_2-2-h)(a_2-k) = A''+1$. Subtracting, we have $a_2(a_2-2) - (a_2-2)k - a_2h = 1$. On one hand $a_2(a_2-2) - a_2h - a_2k = 1-2k$ which implies $a_2|2k-1$. Since $0 < k < a_2$, we must have $a_2 = 2k-1$ which implies $k = \frac{a_2+1}{2}$. Substituting this into $a_2(a_2-2) - a_2h - a_2k = 1-2k$, we obtain $h = \frac{a_2-3}{2}$. Therefore $A'' = (\frac{a_2+1}{2})(\frac{a_2-3}{2})$ and $A' = 2A'' = \frac{(a_2+1)(a_2-3)}{2}$. So $A = \frac{(a_2-2)A'}{2} = \frac{a_2^3-4a_2^2+a_2+6}{4} \leq \frac{1}{4}C^3 - \frac{1}{2}C^2 + \frac{1}{4}C$ for $C \geq 7$, and $B = \frac{a_2(A'+2)}{2} = \frac{a_2(a_2-1)^2}{4} = \frac{a_2^3-2a_2^2+a_2}{4} \leq \frac{1}{4}C^3 - \frac{1}{2}C^2 + \frac{1}{4}C$.

Case 5: $|a_2 - b_2| \geq 3$. If $a_2 < b_2 \leq C$, then $b_2 = (1+\theta)b_1 \leq C$ and $a_2 = (1+\phi)a_1 \leq C-3$ Thus $a_1 \leq \frac{C-3}{1+\phi} < \frac{C-3}{1+\theta}$, $b_1 \leq \frac{C}{1+\theta}$ and $b_2 - b_1 = \theta b_1 \leq \frac{\theta C}{1+\theta}$. Therefore, as $d \geq 1$,

$$B = \frac{1}{d}a_1b_2(b_2-b_1) + b_2 < \frac{C-3}{1+\theta}C\frac{\theta C}{1+\theta} + C = \frac{\theta}{(1+\theta)^2}C^2(C-3) + C.$$

It remains to note that $\frac{\theta}{(1+\theta)^2}$ has maximum value $\frac{1}{4}$ when $\theta = 1$. This gives $B < \frac{1}{4}C^2(C - 3) + C \leq \frac{1}{4}C^3 - \frac{1}{2}C^2 + \frac{1}{4}C$ for $C \geq 3$. When $b_2 < a_2 \leq C$, one obtains $B < \frac{1}{4}C(C-3)^2 + C \leq \frac{1}{4}C^3 - \frac{1}{2}C^2 + \frac{1}{4}C$ via a similar argument. Analogously we have the same bound for A which gives Theorem 2.

4 Proof of Corollary 1

Suppose (x_1, y_1), (x_2, y_2) and (x_3, y_3) are three integer lattice points on the hyperbola $xy = n$ with $x_1 < x_2 < x_3$. Then $n = AB = (A+a_1)(B-b_1) = (A+a_2)(B-b_2)$ where $A = x_1$, $B = y_1$, $a_1 = x_2 - x_1$, $b_1 = y_1 - y_2$, $a_2 = x_3 - x_1$, $b_2 = y_1 - y_3$. Let $C = \max(a_2, b_2)$. Then Theorem 2 tells us that $n = AB \leq (\frac{1}{4}C^3 - \frac{1}{2}C^2 + \frac{1}{4}C)^2 < \frac{1}{16}(C - 0.5)^6$ which implies $2^{2/3}n^{1/6} + 0.5 < C$. We have the first half of Corollary 1. The second half of Corollary 1 follows from the example in (1). Recall

$$n = N(N+1)^2(N+2)(2N+1)(2N+3)$$

where

$$n = [(2N+1)N(N+2)] \cdot [(2N+3)(N+1)^2] =: x_1 \cdot y_1,$$

$$n = [(2N+1)N(N+2) + N] \cdot [(2N+3)(N+1)^2 - (N+1)] =: x_2 \cdot y_2,$$

and

$$n = [(2N+1)N(N+2) + (2N+1)] \cdot [(2N+3)(N+1)^2 - (2N+3)] =: x_3 \cdot y_3.$$

Then $\max(x_3 - x_1, y_1 - y_3) = 2N + 3$. One can see that $n/4 = N(N+1/2)(N+1)^2(N+3/2)(N+2) \geq (N+0.9)^6$ when n is sufficiently large. This implies $n^{1/6}/2^{1/3} > N + 0.9$ or $2^{2/3}n^{1/6} > 2N + 1.8$. Hence $2^{2/3}n^{1/6} + 1.2 > 2N + 3$.

References

[1] A. Granville and J. Jiménez-Urroz, The least common multiple and lattice points on hyperbolas, Quarterly Journal of Mathematics (Oxford) vol 51 (2000), 343–352.

Department of Arts and Sciences
Victory University
255 N. Highland St.,
Memphis, TN 38111
U.S.A.
thchan@victory.edu